UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF VIRGINIA Charlottesville Division

ELIZABETH SINES, SETH WISPELWEY, MARISSA BLAIR, TYLER MAGILL, APRIL MUNIZ, HANNAH PEARCE, MARCUS MARTIN, NATALIE ROMERO, CHELSEA ALVARADO, and JOHN DOE,

Plaintiffs,

v.

JASON KESSLER, RICHARD SPENCER, CHRISTOPHER CANTWELL, JAMES ALEX FIELDS, JR., VANGUARD AMERICA, ANDREW ANGLIN, MOONBASE HOLDINGS, LLC, ROBERT "AZZMADOR" RAY, NATHAN DAMIGO. ELLIOT KLINE a/k/a/ ELI MOSLEY, IDENTITY EVROPA, MATTHEW HEIMBACH, MATTHEW PARROTT a/k/a DAVID MATTHEW PARROTT, TRADITIONALIST WORKER PARTY, MICHAEL HILL, MICHAEL TUBBS, LEAGUE OF THE SOUTH, JEFF SCHOEP, NATIONAL SOCIALIST MOVEMENT, NATIONALIST FRONT, AUGUSTUS SOL INVICTUS, FRATERNAL ORDER OF THE ALT-KNIGHTS, MICHAEL "ENOCH" PEINOVICH, LOYAL WHITE KNIGHTS OF THE KU KLUX KLAN, and EAST COAST KNIGHTS OF THE KU KLUX KLAN a/k/a EAST COAST KNIGHTS OF THE TRUE INVISIBLE EMPIRE,

Defendants.

Civil Action No. 3:17-cv-00072-NKM

JURY TRIAL DEMANDED

PLAINTIFFS' NOTICE CONCERNING THE STATUS OF DEFENDANT PEINOVICH'S MOTIONS TO QUASH

Plaintiffs respectfully submit this Notice Concerning the Status of Defendant Peinovich's Motions to Quash ("Notice") in response to the Court's July 12, 2018 Order (ECF No. 341, the "Order") and to inform the Court that, for the reasons contained herein, no further briefing is necessary and Peinovich's Objections should be denied.¹

On May 4, 2018, Peinovich filed Objections (ECF No. 309) to Judge Hoppe's April 20, 2018 order (ECF No. 304) denying Peinovich's motions to quash subpoenas served by Plaintiffs on Twitter, Inc., GoDaddy.com, LLC, Cloudflare, LLC, and Hatreon. For the reasons set forth in Plaintiffs' response to Peinovich's Objections, (ECF No. 312), Judge Hoppe's April 20, 2018 order declining to quash Plaintiffs' subpoenas was neither "clearly erroneous" nor "contrary to law." *Wyatt* v. *Owens*, No. 7:14-Civ-492, 2016 WL 6651410, at *1 (W.D. Va. Nov. 10, 2016) (Moon, J.) (quoting Fed. R. Civ. P. 72(a)). Accordingly, on that basis alone, Peinovich's Objections to Judge' Hoppe's order should be denied.

Peinovich's conversion from a party to a non-party does not alter that result. Fourth Circuit authority makes clear that "[r]egardless of whether a motion is made under Rule 26(c) or Rule 45(d), the party opposing discovery has the obligation to submit evidence supporting its claims that the discovery is unduly burdensome, oppressive, or irrelevant." *In re C.R. Bard, Inc. Pelvic Repair Sys. Prod. Liab. Litig.*, No. MDL 2187, 2014 WL 1660386, at *3 (S.D. W. Va. Apr. 22, 2014); *see also In re Monitronics Int'l Inc.*, No. MDL 1:13-MD-2493, 2014 WL 12623046, at *3 (N.D.W. Va. June 19, 2014). Therefore, had Judge Hoppe considered Peinovich's

-

Pursuant to the Court's direction, Plaintiffs met and conferred with Peinovich concerning "(1) whether the Court's order dismissing Defendant Peinovich changes the scope of relevant information that may be sought by Plaintiffs' subpoenas, and (2) whether any supplemental briefing is needed to address this change or the posture of the motion." (ECF No. 341.) The parties disagreed as to whether Peinovich's dismissal changed the scope of relevant information that may be sought by Plaintiffs' subpoenas and this Notice therefore follows.

motion as a non-party under Rule 45 rather than under Rule 26, as he did, the same standard would apply and dictate the same result. *See In re C.R. Bard, Inc. Pelvic Repair Sys. Prod. Liab. Litig.*, 2014 WL 1660386, at *2–3. For this additional reason, Judge Hoppe's analysis remains correct, the Objections should be denied, and no supplemental briefing is required.

Finally, the fact that Peinovich is no longer a party does not alter the scope of discovery in this case. The subpoenas seek information relevant to the coordination among Defendants and coconspirators who used certain websites to plan violence and coordinate the Unite the Right rally. *See* ECF No. 249 at 2–3. This includes information concerning Defendants and coconspirators other than Peinovich. Moreover, although Peinovich has been dismissed from the case, he remains an alleged coconspirator of Defendants. Therefore, information pertaining to his statements and actions similarly remain relevant to Plaintiffs' claims and the information sought by the subpoenas continue to fall within the "broad" scope of "freely permitted" discovery under the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. *Bell Inc.* v. *GE Lighting, LLC*, No. 6:14-cv-00012, 2014 WL 1630754, at *6 (W.D. Va. Apr. 23, 2014) (Moon, J.).

CONCLUSION

For the reasons set forth above, in Judge Hoppe's order, and in Plaintiffs' Response to Peinovich's Objections (ECF No. 312), the Court should consider Peinovich's Objections as presently stated and deny them.

Dated: July 26, 2018

Roberta A. Kaplan (pro hac vice)
Julie E. Fink (pro hac vice)
Gabrielle E. Tenzer (pro hac vice)
Christopher B. Greene (pro hac vice)
Seguin L. Strohmeier (pro hac vice)
KAPLAN HECKER & FINK LLP
350 Fifth Avenue, Suite 7110
New York, NY 10118
Telephone: (212) 763-0883
rkaplan@kaplanhecker.com
jfink@kaplanhecker.com
gtenzer@kaplanhecker.com
sstrohmeier@kaplanhecker.com

Philip M. Bowman (pro hac vice)
Yotam Barkai (pro hac vice)
Joshua J. Libling (pro hac vice)
BOIES SCHILLER FLEXNER LLP
575 Lexington Ave.
New York, NY 10022
Telephone: (212) 446-2300
Fax: (212) 446-2350
pbowman@bsfllp.com
ybarkai@bsfllp.com
jlibling@bsfllp.com

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Robert T. Cahill
Robert T. Cahill (VSB No. 38562)
COOLEY LLP
11951 Freedom Drive, 14th Floor
Reston, VA 20190-5656
Telephone: (703) 456-8000
Fax: (703) 456-8100
rcahill@cooley.com

J. Benjamin Rottenborn (VSB No. 84796) WOODS ROGERS PLC 10 South Jefferson Street, Suite 1400 Roanoke, Virginia 24011 Telephone: (540) 983-7600 Facsimile: (540) 983-7711 brottenborn@woodsrogers.com

Karen L. Dunn (pro hac vice)
William A. Isaacson (pro hac vice)
BOIES SCHILLER FLEXNER LLP
1401 New York Ave, NW
Washington, DC 20005
Telephone: (202) 237-2727
Fax: (202) 237-6131
kdunn@bsfllp.com
wisaacson@bsfllp.com

Alan Levine (pro hac vice)
COOLEY LLP

1114 Avenue of the Americas, 46th Floor

New York, NY 10036 Telephone: (212) 479-6260

Fax: (212) 479-6275 alevine@cooley.com

David E. Mills (*pro hac vice*) COOLEY LLP 1299 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW Suite 700 Washington, DC 20004

Telephone: (202) 842-7800 Fax: (202) 842-7899

Fax: (202) 842-7899 dmills@cooley.com

Counsel for Plaintiffs

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on July 26, 2018, I filed the foregoing with the Clerk of Court through the CM/ECF system, which will send notice of the electronic filing to:

Justin Saunders Gravatt
David L. Hauck
David L. Campbell
Duane, Hauck, Davis & Gravatt, P.C.
100 West Franklin Street, Suite 100
Richmond, VA 23220
jgravatt@dhdglaw.com
dhauck@dhdglaw.com
dcampbell@dhdglaw.com

Bryan Jones 106 W. South St., Suite 211 Charlottesville, VA 22902 bryan@bjoneslegal.com

Counsel for Defendants Michael Hill, Michael Tubbs, and League of the South

Counsel for Defendant James A. Fields, Jr.

James E. Kolenich Kolenich Law Office 9435 Waterstone Blvd. #140 Cincinnati, OH 45249 jek318@gmail.com John A. DiNucci, Esq. 8180 Greensboro Drive Suite 1150 McLean, Virginia 22102 dinuccilaw@outlook.com

Counsel for Defendants Jeff Schoep, Nationalist Front, National Socialist Movement, Matthew Parrott, Matthew Heimbach, Robert Ray, Traditionalist Worker Party, Elliot Kline, Jason Kessler, Vanguard America, Nathan Damigo, Identity Europa, Inc. (Identity Evropa), and Christopher Cantwell Counsel for Defendant Richard Spencer

Defendant Michael Peinovich (pro se)

I further hereby certify that on July 26, 2018, I also served the following non-ECF participants, via U.S. mail, First Class and postage prepaid, addressed as follows:

Loyal White Knights of the Ku Klux Klan a/k/a Loyal White Knights Church of the Invisible Empire, Inc. c/o Chris and Amanda Barker P.O. Box 54 Pelham, NC 27311

Fraternal Order of the Alt-Knights c/o Kyle Chapman 52 Lycett Circle Daly City, CA 94015

Augustus Sol Invictus 9823 4th Avenue Orlando, FL 32824 East Coast Knights of the Ku Klux Klan a/k/a East Coast Knights of the True Invisible Empire 26 South Pine St. Red Lion, PA 17356

Moonbase Holdings, LLC c/o Andrew Anglin P.O. Box 208 Worthington, OH 43085

Andrew Anglin P.O. Box 208 Worthington, OH 43085

<u>s/Robert T. Cahill</u>

Robert T. Cahill (VSB 38562) COOLEY LLP 11951 Freedom Drive, 14th Floor Reston, VA 20190-5656 Telephone: (703) 456-8000

Fax: (703) 456-8100

Email: rcahill@cooley.com

Counsel for Plaintiffs